

Logarithmic Correlations in Quenched Random Magnets and Polymers

John Cardy

*University of Oxford, Department of Physics – Theoretical Physics, 1 Keble Road, Oxford OX1 3NP, U.K.
and All Souls College, Oxford.*

It is argued that logarithmic factors multiplying power law behavior are to be expected in the scaling behavior at or near non-mean field critical points of systems with short-range interactions described theoretically by any kind of $n \rightarrow 0$ limit, in which the effective free energy vanishes. Explicit examples are given for quenched random ferromagnets, polymer statistics and percolation, but the phenomenon is quite general.

PACS numbers: 05.70.Jk, 11.25.Hf, 64.60.Ak

Logarithmic corrections to power law behavior at or near a critical point are normally associated with the presence of operators which are marginally irrelevant under the renormalisation group. The amplitudes of such logarithmic terms vanish if the critical theory happens to lie exactly at the fixed point. However, it has been pointed out [1] that the structure of two-dimensional conformal field theory, which describes the fixed point in a wide range of isotropic systems with short-range interactions, allows so-called *logarithmic* operators in the fixed point theory itself, whose operator product expansions and correlation functions contain logarithms as well as pure power behavior.

Such operators should not occur in unitary conformal field theories, such as correspond to pure critical systems with positive Boltzmann weights, for the following reasons. Any real local density $\Phi(r)$ may always be expanded in a series of scaling operators $\Phi(r) = \sum_i a_i \phi_i(r)$, so that its two-point correlation function in $\mathbf{R}^d$ takes the form

$$\langle \Phi(r) \Phi(0) \rangle \sim \sum_{ij} \frac{A_{ij}}{r^{x_i+x_j}} \quad (1)$$

where the scaling dimensions x_i are the eigenvalues of the dilatation operator $\mathcal{D}$. The off-diagonal terms with $x_i \neq x_j$ vanish by conformal symmetry. In addition, the diagonal coefficients A_{ii} are all non-negative as a consequence of reflection positivity. Thus, in such a theory, only pure powers, or sums of them, should ever appear [2]. However, in non-unitary conformal field theories, it is possible for some of the A_{ii} to be negative, in which case cancellations may occur in (1). In particular, if two scaling dimensions x_i and x_j become degenerate in such a way that $A_{ii} \sim -A_{jj} \rightarrow \infty$ with $A_{ii}(x_i - x_j)$ remaining finite, the leading terms will cancel leaving a logarithmic term proportional to $r^{-2x_i} \ln r$.

The main point of this paper is that such logarithmic terms should always occur in models which are described by non-trivial fixed point theories with a trivial partition function $Z = 1$, in an arbitrary number of dimensions. These include all sorts of quenched random systems including percolation, as well as problems such as

self-avoiding random walks describing polymer statistics. Such logarithmic operators have already been identified in some systems [3] which may be analysed using supersymmetry to perform the quenched average, and there has been considerable work [4] on the general structure of such logarithmic CFTs. We shall use instead the replica formalism, which has the advantage of being more generally applicable, as well as providing a simple way of seeing how the logarithmic terms appear in the limit. It will be seen that logarithms appear as the leading contributions in some quite simple two-point correlation functions, as well as completely generally as subleading terms in higher order ones.

The analysis depends on some very simple properties of conformal field theory which are valid in all dimensions, not only $d = 2$. That is, they should hold for all critical theories of the above types as long as d is below the upper critical dimension. A crucial role is also played by the symmetry group of the theory, be it the permutation group S_n of the replicas, or $O(n)$ for polymers. Rather than work in complete generality we shall give two illustrative examples which are moreover physically relevant.

Consider first a quenched random ferromagnet, for example an Ising model with random bond disorder. Such systems may be described generically in the continuum limit by a reduced hamiltonian $H = H^0 + \int m(r)E(r)d^d r$, where H^0 describes the pure system and $m(r)$ is a quenched random variable coupled to the local energy density $E(r)$. The disorder is supposed to have short-range correlations only, so that $\overline{m(r)} = 0$ and $\overline{m(r)m(r')} = g\delta_{rr'}$. Introducing replicas $a = 1, \dots, n$ in the standard way and averaging over the disorder gives the replica hamiltonian

$$H_R \equiv \sum_a H_a^0 - g \int \sum_{a \neq b} E_a(r) E_b(r) d^d r$$

where the higher cumulants have been dropped on the basis that they are irrelevant in the RG sense. The terms with $a = b$ are discarded because they can be further reduced using the operator product expansion (OPE) in the pure theory which takes the form $E_a \cdot E_a = 1 + b_0 E_a + \dots$.

The dimension of g is $y_g = d - 2x_E^0$, and it is relevant at the pure fixed point if $d > 2x_E^0$. This is equivalent to the well-known Harris criterion $d\nu^0 < 2$ [5]. If y_g is small, it is possible to develop a perturbative RG in powers of this variable and to locate a random fixed point to which critical systems with sufficiently weak randomness should flow [6,7]. The shift in the scaling dimension x_ϕ of some scaling operator ϕ from the pure to the random fixed point is given by [7]

$$x_\phi = x_\phi^0 + (2b_\phi/b)y_g + O(y_g^2)$$

where b and b_ϕ are the coefficients in the OPEs $\Phi \cdot \Phi = 1 + b\Phi + \dots$ and $\phi \cdot \Phi = b_\phi\phi + \dots$, and Φ is the perturbing operator, in this case $\sum_{a \neq b} E_a E_b$, which, using the above OPE of the pure theory, gives $b = 4(n-2) + 2b_0^2$.

Now consider the case where ϕ is itself the replicated energy density E_a . The main point is that all these n operators are degenerate at the pure fixed point, and, to carry out the perturbative expansion, they should be decomposed into irreducible representations of the replica permutation group S_n . In this case this is straightforward: the combination $E \equiv \sum_a E_a$ is a singlet, leaving $\tilde{E}_a \equiv E_a - (1/n)\sum_b E_b$, with $\sum_a \tilde{E}_a = 0$, transforming according to an $(n-1)$ -dimensional representation. The OPE coefficients are easily found: $b_E = 2(n-1)$ and $b_{\tilde{E}} = -2$, so that, close to $n = 0$, $x_E(n) = x_E^0 + \frac{1}{2}(1-n)y_g + O(y_g^2)$ and $x_{\tilde{E}}(n) = x_E^0 + \frac{1}{2}y_g + O(y_g^2)$. Note that the two scaling dimensions agree at $n = 0$. This is in fact true to all orders, and is a consequence of the fact [8] that the partition function of any CFT on $\mathbf{S}_1 \times \mathbf{S}_{d-1}$ takes the form $Z = \sum_i q^{x_i}$, where q is a modular parameter. Since $Z = 1$ at $n = 0$, all scaling operators must arrange themselves to have multiplicities proportional to n as $n \rightarrow 0$. Thus the singlet operator E becomes degenerate with the $(n-1)$ operators $\tilde{E}_a$. Assume that the difference between the scaling dimensions vanishes linearly in n , as it does to first order.

The two-point functions therefore take the form, for $n \neq 0$,

$$\begin{aligned} \langle E(r)E(0) \rangle &= n(\langle E_1 E_1 \rangle + (n-1)\langle E_1 E_2 \rangle) \\ &\sim nA(n)r^{-2x_E(n)} \end{aligned} \quad (2)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \langle \tilde{E}_a(r)\tilde{E}_a(0) \rangle &= (1-1/n)(\langle E_1 E_1 \rangle - \langle E_1 E_2 \rangle) \\ &\sim (1-1/n)\tilde{A}(n)r^{-2x_{\tilde{E}}(n)} \end{aligned} \quad (3)$$

where replica symmetry has been used in the first equalities. The amplitudes $A(n)$ and $\tilde{A}(n)$ have finite limits at $n = 0$ in the pure theory and therefore should remain so at the random fixed point. For consistency between (2) and (3) $A(0) = \tilde{A}(0)$. Subtracting the two expressions and letting $n \rightarrow 0$,

$$\begin{aligned} \overline{\langle E(r) \rangle \langle E(0) \rangle} &= \lim_{n \rightarrow 0} \langle E_1(r)E_2(r) \rangle \\ &\sim 2A(0)x'_E(0) \ln r / r^{-2x_E(0)} \end{aligned}$$

The left hand side of this equation gives the physical meaning of the replica expression $\langle E_1 E_2 \rangle$: it is the quenched average of the *disconnected* part of the energy-energy correlation function. Note that the connected piece $\langle EE \rangle - \langle E \rangle \langle E \rangle = \langle E_1 E_1 \rangle - \langle E_1 E_2 \rangle$ is given by the $n \rightarrow 0$ limit of both equations above and contains no logarithm. Although the amplitude $A(0)$ is non-universal, the ratio of the quenched average of the disconnected piece to that of the connected piece is asymptotically proportional to $\ln r$ with a *universal* amplitude.

Such a phenomenon does not occur for the correlation functions of the local magnetisation σ [9]. Taking the example of an Ising model, the replicated hamiltonian is invariant under independent Z_2 transformations $\sigma_a \rightarrow -\sigma_a$ in each replica, as well as replica permutations. Under this larger symmetry, the operators $\{\sigma_a\}$ transform irreducibly, so that $x_\sigma(n) = x_{\tilde{\sigma}}(n)$ for all n . However, as argued below, logarithms do appear in higher-point correlations of σ . Logarithms also appear in certain two-point functions of composite operators $E_{a_1} E_{a_2} \dots E_{a_p}$, which correspond to higher moments $\overline{\langle EE \rangle^p}$ of the two-point function (and which exhibit multiscaling). These arise [10] from a similar mechanism to the above: the singlet operator $(\sum_b E_b)^p$ becomes degenerate with the $(n-1)$ independent operators $(\sum_b E_b)^{p-1}(E_a - (1/n)\sum_b E_b)$, but only exactly at $n = 0$. Note also that it has been observed [11] that logarithmic operators whose 2-point functions behave like $\langle D(r)D(0) \rangle \sim r^{-2x}(\ln r + \text{const.})$ are always accompanied by another operator C such that $\langle C(r)D(0) \rangle \sim r^{-2x}$ and $\langle C(r)C(0) \rangle = 0$. In this example, $C = E$ and $D = E_a$, in the limit $n = 0$, so that D is a reducible operator under the replica symmetry.

As a second example, consider self-avoiding walks, which are a model for polymer statistics, and are described [12] by the $n \rightarrow 0$ limit of an n -component field theory with a hamiltonian with $O(n)$ symmetry $\int (\sum_a ((\nabla \phi_a)^2 + m^2 \phi_a^2) + g \sum_{ab} \phi_a^2 \phi_b^2) d^d r$. Consider the composite operators of the form $:\phi_a \phi_b:$ (the normal ordering subtracts the disconnected part $\langle \phi_a \phi_b \rangle$). These may be decomposed under $O(n)$ into a singlet $E \equiv \sum_a :\phi_a^2:$ and a symmetric traceless part $\tilde{E}_{ab} \equiv :\phi_a \phi_b: - (1/n)\delta_{ab} \sum_c :\phi_c^2:$, with $(n-1)(n+2)/2$ independent components. In general, these two irreducible sets carry different scaling dimensions, as can be checked in perturbation theory in g : at one loop, the relevant OPE coefficients are $b_E = 8 + 4n$ and $b_{\tilde{E}} = 8$. Once again, they become degenerate at $n = 0$ so that $Z = 1$ [13]. Their two-point functions have the form

$$\begin{aligned} \langle E(r)E(0) \rangle &= 2nA(n)r^{-2x_E(n)} \\ \langle \tilde{E}_{ab}\tilde{E}_{cd}(0) \rangle &= (\delta_{ac}\delta_{bd} + \delta_{bc}\delta_{ad} - \frac{2}{n}\delta_{ab}\delta_{cd})\tilde{A}(n)r^{-2x_{\tilde{E}}(n)} \end{aligned}$$

where the index structure is fixed by group theory and the amplitudes $A(n)$ and $\tilde{A}(n)$ are finite

at $n = 0$. Now consider the correlation function $\langle : \phi_a(r) \phi_b(r) : \rangle \equiv \langle \phi_a(0) \phi_b(0) \rangle$ and express this in terms of $\langle EE \rangle$ and $\langle \tilde{E} \tilde{E} \rangle$. There is then a singular term proportional to $(\delta_{ab} \delta_{cd}/n)(A(n)r^{-2x_E(n)} - \tilde{A}(n)r^{-2x_{\tilde{E}}(n)})$, which gives rise to a logarithm at $n = 0$. A similar argument may be made away from the critical point, where the two-point function of each scaling operator should scale as $\xi^{-2x_i(n)} f_i(r/\xi, n)$ where ξ is the correlation length. This implies that the generalized susceptibilities $\chi_E \equiv \sum_r \langle E(r_1) E(r_2) \rangle$ and $\chi_{\tilde{E}} \equiv \sum_r \langle \tilde{E}(r_1) \tilde{E}(r_2) \rangle$ should behave as $C_i(n) \xi^{d-2x_i(n)}$, where $i \in \{E, \tilde{E}\}$ and $C_E(0) = C_{\tilde{E}}(0)$.

The physical interpretation of this is as follows. The term proportional to $\delta_{ab} \delta_{cd}$ in the full correlation function counts all pairs of mutually avoiding self-avoiding loops (polygons on a lattice) one of which goes through r_1 , and the other through r_2 . The normal ordering subtracts off the disconnected piece which corresponds to the product of the independent sums over such pairs of loops, in which they are allowed to intersect. Therefore the remaining connected part, to which the above is the leading contribution, corresponds to all configurations where the two loops intersect at least once. Denoting by c_N the number of such pairs of loops, of total length N , per lattice site, the mapping to the $O(n)$ model is such that its generating function $\sum_N N^2 c_N y^N$ is proportional to $\lim_{n \rightarrow 0} (\chi_E - \chi_{\tilde{E}})/n$, with $\xi \propto (y_c - y)^{-\nu}$. This implies that $c_N \sim N^{(d-2x_E)\nu-3} \mu^N \ln N = N^{\alpha-3} \mu^N \ln N$, where $\mu = y_c^{-1}$. For monodisperse loops, there is an additional factor of N^{-1} . This agrees with an alternative method: the free energy per site $f(n)$ of the $O(n)$ model scales as $B(n)(x_c - x)^{2-\alpha(n)}$, where $B(0) = 0$. Since each loop appears with fugacity n , the second derivative $\partial f / \partial n|_{n=0}$ counts pairs of intersecting loops, and its leading singularity [14] is of the form $B'(0)\alpha'(0)(x_c - x)^{2-\alpha(0)} \ln(x_c - x)$, consistent with the above result.

Although we have given two examples of how logarithmic factors occur in two-point functions, it is worth pointing out that they are ubiquitous in four- and higher-point functions in fixed point theories with $Z = 1$. This is because conformal invariance fixes the coefficient of the stress tensor T in the OPE of an operator ϕ with itself to have the form $\phi \cdot \phi = a_\phi(\mathbf{1} + (x_\phi/c)T + \dots)$, where all the co-ordinate dependence and the complicated index structure has been suppressed [15]. Here a_ϕ defines the normalisation of ϕ and c is the central charge, defined in arbitrary dimension in terms of the two-point function $\langle T(r)T(0) \rangle \propto c/r^d$, where again the index structure has been suppressed. Substituting these terms of the OPE into the 4-point function $\langle \phi(r_1)\phi(r_2)\phi(r_3)\phi(r_4) \rangle$ in the limit where $\eta \equiv r_{12}r_{34}/r_{13}r_{24} \ll 1$ gives a term proportional to $(r_{12}r_{34})^{-2x_\phi} (a_\phi^2/c)\eta^d$. In a theory such as those discussed above, with $c = 0$, this raises a potential difficulty [16]. The resolution is that, in general, there are other operators whose scaling dimensions be-

come degenerate with that of T as $n \rightarrow 0$. For the quenched random ferromagnet, these are the operators $T_a \equiv T_a - (1/n) \sum_b T_b$, constructed in a similar way to the $\tilde{E}_a$ above. For the $O(n)$ model, they are traceless part of $\tilde{T}_{ab}^{\mu\nu} \equiv \partial^\mu \phi_a \partial^\nu \phi_b + \dots$, whose trace over $a = b$ gives the stress tensor $T^{\mu\nu}$. These operators give rise to logarithmic terms of the form $\eta^d \ln \eta$ in the four-point functions at $n = 0$.

However, the paradox may be resolved in another way. The physical correlation functions may be such that $a_\phi \rightarrow 0$ as $c \rightarrow 0$. This in fact happens in the q -state Potts model where all connected correlations vanish linearly at $q = 1$, so that $a_\phi \propto c$. The connectivities of the percolation problem are given by the derivatives with respect to q at $q = 1$, and are finite. But in this case there are no logarithmic terms of the above form [17].

It would be very interesting to understand how the $(n-1)$ bosonic partners of the stress tensor like $\tilde{T}$ become its fermionic partners in those cases where the quenched average can be performed using supersymmetry [18].

We have argued that logarithmic factors multiplying power law singularities are ubiquitous in critical systems described by effective theories with $Z = 1$. In general they hide themselves in non-leading corrections to higher-point correlations, but there are examples where they appear in two-point correlations and susceptibilities. Although all conclusions are for general d , it is possible to check some of them in $d = 2$ for percolation and the $O(n)$ model [19], where many of the critical four-point functions are known exactly.

The author thanks V. Gurarie, I. Kogan and H. Saleur for useful discussions, and the Aspen Center for Physics for its hospitality. This research was supported in part by the Engineering and Physical Sciences Research Council under Grant GR/J78327.

-
- [1] V. Gurarie, Nucl. Phys. B **410**, 535 (1993).
 - [2] Logarithmic factors could also arise if the spectrum of $\mathcal{D}$ were continuous, but these would in general not be positive integral powers.
 - [3] J.-S. Caux, I. Kogan and A. M. Tsvelik, Nucl. Phys. B **466**, 444 (1996); Z. Maasarani and D. Serban, Nucl. Phys. B **489**, 603 (1997); J.-S. Caux, N. Taniguchi and A. M. Tsvelik, Nucl. Phys. B **525**, 671 (1998).
 - [4] M. Flohr, Int. J. Mod. Phys. A **11**, 4147 (1996); Int. J. Mod. Phys. A **12**, 1943 (1997); M. R. Rahimi Tabar, A. Aghamohammadi and M. Khorrami, Nucl. Phys. B **497**, 555 (1997); A. M. Ghezelbash and V. Karimipour, Phys. Lett. B **402**, 282 (1997); I. I. Kogan and A. Lewis, Nucl. Phys. B **509**, 687 (1998).
 - [5] A. B. Harris, J. Phys. C **7**, 1671 (1974).

- [6] A. W. W. Ludwig, Nucl. Phys. B **285**, 97 (1987);
A. W. W. Ludwig, Nucl. Phys. B **330**, 639 (1990).
- [7] J. L. Cardy, *Scaling and Renormalisation in Statistical Physics*, Ch. 5, Cambridge University Press, 1996.
- [8] J. L. Cardy, Nucl. Phys. B **366** 403, (1991).
- [9] It would occur for the random *field* problem, if it were described by a conformally invariant fixed point.
- [10] T. S. Davis and J. L. Cardy, in preparation.
- [11] See Caux et al. in Ref. 3.
- [12] P.-G. de Gennes, Phys. Lett. A **38**, 339 (1972).
- [13] In two dimensions, the operators $\tilde{E}_{ab}$ have been identified in the operator content of the $O(n)$ model by P. di Francesco, H. Saleur and J.-B. Zuber (Nucl. Phys. B **300**, 393 (1988)) and indeed they do become degenerate with the energy operator as $n \rightarrow 0$.
- [14] In fact there is a more important term $O(N^{\alpha-2}\mu^N)$ which mathematically arises from the fact that y_c depends on n , and physically from the contribution when one of the loops is small. This is removed by considering loops of equal length.
- [15] J. L. Cardy, Nucl. Phys. B **290**, 355 (1987).
- [16] This was pointed out in V. Gurarie, Nucl. Phys. B **546**, 774 (1999), although in this supersymmetric case it is resolved differently.
- [17] However, at least in $d = 2$, logarithms do arise at a higher level because the coefficient of $T\bar{T}$ in the OPE is $O(1/c^2)$.
- [18] V. Gurarie, *op. cit.*
- [19] T. S. Davis and J. L. Cardy, in preparation.